

**MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF
THE HAMILTON COUNTY SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
POLICY COMMITTEE MEETING
November 15, 2007**

DATE: November 15, 2007

TIME: 1:30 pm

PLACE: Winton Woods Golf Course – Mill Race Banquet Center
1515 W. Sharon Road
Cincinnati, Ohio 45240

PRESENT: **Policy Committee Members**

Joe Charlton, Back-Up for Tiffaney Hardy
Tony DiPuccio, Generator Representative
Tim Ingram, Hamilton County Public Health Representative
Dave Meyer, Public Member

Staff

Michelle Balz, Program Specialist
Cory Chadwick, Director
Holly Christmann, Solid Waste Program Manager
Sarah Dowers, Public Affairs Coordinator
Ali Khodadad, Operations Coordinator
Susan Schumacher, Administrative Secretary, Clerk
Catherine Walsh, Program Specialist

Others in Attendance

Barrett Brunsman, Cincinnati Enquirer
Chuck DeJonekheere, Hamilton County General Health District
Shaun R. Finley, University of Cincinnati
Dave Fossaluzza, St. Bernard
Sumana Keener, University of Cincinnati
Joe Kempe, St. Bernard
Bob Knight, GBBN Architects
Jim Lindemood, Resident
Bob Orr, CSI
Sam Sherrill, University of Cincinnati
Nancy Sunnenberg, Urban Timber
Tom Turchiano, Rumpke

ABSENT: **Policy Committee Members**

Bernie Fiedeldej, Township Representative, Vice Chair
Tiffaney Hardy, Representative of Largest Municipality
Todd Portune, County Commissioner, Chair

Larry Riddle, Ex-Officio Member
Glenn Welling, General Interest Member

1. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Ingram introduced himself and called the meeting to order at 1:30 pm. Mr. Ingram stated that he was serving as pro-temp Chair in light of Mr. Portune's and Mr. Fiedeldey's absence. Mr. Ingram welcomed Mr. Charlton to the meeting as Ms. Hardy's back-up.

2. CLERK'S REPORT

A. Approval of Minutes – September 20, 2007

Mr. Ingram entertained a motion to approve the September 20, 2007 minutes. Mr. Meyer moved; Mr. DiPuccio seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

B. Additions to the Agenda

Ms. Christmann stated that there were no additions to the agenda but under Policy Items, "Update on Landfill Odors" was omitted from the Agenda but was included within the Manager's Memo.

3. DISTRICT REVENUE UPDATES/ANALYSIS

Ms. Christmann stated that revenue, overall, is up comparing 2006 to 2007; roughly \$167,000. As discussed at previous meetings, this is due to out-of-district tonnages.

Ms. Christmann stated that in addition to the revenue analysis, also included was a trend analysis showing quarter by quarter District revenue and tonnages. Additionally, as requested at the last meeting, also included was a chart that shows total tonnage by quarter.

Ms. Christmann thanked Mr. Khodadad for his assistance with the charts.

Mr. Ingram asked if there was a motion to approve the revenue report. Mr. DiPuccio moved; Mr. Charlton seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

4. POLICY ITEMS

A. Utilizing Urban Wood Waste

Ms. Christmann stated that several months ago when the Emerald Ash Borer (EAB) was first discovered in Hamilton County, the Committee requested that a task force be put together to find ways to use the urban wood waste; primarily Ash but also other types of trees.

Ms. Christmann stated that the task force was wonderful to work with and stated that following were the members: Dave Gamstetter and Kurt

Kastner with the Cincinnati Park Board, Joe Boggs, OSU Extension Office, Nancy Sunnenberg, Sam Sherill, Richard Steward, Carriage House Farm, Matt Bumgardner, U.S. Forest Service, Bob Knight and Mark Lee from GBBN Architects

Ms. Christmann stated that the goal of this group was to develop a plan for higher and better use for urban wood waste, including Ash. Ms. Christmann stated that the group identified local and regional sawmill owners and stationary mills interested in receiving urban Ash.

Ms. Christmann stated that the task force also identified outlets for the milled material with the largest customer being Cincinnati Public Schools. Other outlets include local architectural firms, a local home construction company, as well as, a specialty wood work and retail store.

Ms. Christmann discussed the project planned for Cincinnati Public Schools.

Ms. Christmann stated that to date, Cincinnati Park Board is preparing a request for bids for sawmilling services with the goal of having a contract by February, 2008. Cincinnati Park Board is also having discussions with a kiln in Northern Kentucky to discuss logistics of transporting the material from the mills to the kiln, quantities, etc.

Ms. Christmann stated the first phase of the project is underway with the milling services. Cincinnati Park Board has also identified Ash trees that will be coming down as early as December.

Ms. Christmann stated that Cincinnati Park Board and Cincinnati Public Schools are coming together on an agreement for Cincinnati Park Board to supply the Ash to the school. Ms. Christmann gave several examples.

Ms. Christmann stated that at this point, the task force would like to expand this to the County where there would be 3 to 4 staging areas so municipalities could bring saw logs where they could be milled and shipped to the kiln for drying.

Ms. Christmann stated that the task force is working through some issues, such as allowing private tree companies to drop-off at these sites, as well. Allowing this would require education to the tree companies. Ms. Christmann stated that to provide this education, the task force is working with the Ohio Department of Natural Resources – Division of Forestry and the OSU Extension office to provide training sessions to the mills and the tree companies.

Ms. Christmann stated that the project was coming along nicely. Ms. Sunnenberg stated that Ms. Christmann gave a good recap on the project and stated that everyone was working diligently to look at it very broadly and long range.

Mr. Sherrill stated that if this all comes together, Cincinnati will be the first city in the country to do something this extensive with public and private partnerships compared to any other city in the country.

A brief question/answer session ensued.

Mr. DiPuccio questioned the zero waste program in schools; was it ongoing or does it also encompass the actual construction base itself? Mr. Knight stated that it was both and briefly explained the program. Mr. Ingram asked that the Policy Committee be kept informed. A brief discussion ensued.

B. 2008 Budget

Ms. Christmann stated that in lieu of the last Policy Committee meeting, Staff has reworked the budget to include \$5,000 for the Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Program. Ms. Christmann stated that the goal of this program was to provide incentives for County agencies to buy products such as recycled-content items.

Ms. Christmann stated that she met with Commissioner Portune regarding the concerns of this program and also spoke with County Administration. They want the County to have an environmentally preferable purchasing policy and this was the main reason this item has been included in the budget.

Ms. Christmann stated that since the last meeting, the District received updated personnel and benefit cost information from the budget office. The updated budget for personnel and benefit costs has decreased by \$8,000. This decrease is due to reduced health costs and reduced employee raises as determined by the County.

Ms. Christmann stated that with these changes, the proposed 2008 budget is \$2.992 million and if totally expended, it will result in a drawdown of the carry-over. Staff is predicting revenues of approximately \$2.82 million.

Ms. Christmann stated that as reported at the last meeting, some costs have increased; overall personnel and benefits increased by approximately \$28,000. As mentioned at the last meeting, both the yardwaste program and the household hazardous waste program are both recommended for an increase of \$20,000 each.

Ms. Christmann stated to make up for those increases, Staff has reduced some program expenses as mentioned at the last meeting:

- \$23,500 decrease in advertising for programs and outreach
- \$17,900 reduction in Cincinnati Health Department costs based on contract
- \$8,500 reduction in printing and postage costs for *The Interchange* as it will be moved to an e-newsletter in 2008
- \$8,000 reduction in school programs based on past year's usage
- \$6,750 reduction in miscellaneous costs such as subscriptions, office supplies, and travel
- \$6,000 reduction in compost bin sale based on previous year's usage

Ms. Christmann stated that in terms of the carry-over balance, if the budget is 100% expended, this would leave a carry-over balance of \$2.5 million as of January 1, 2009 which is equal to approximately 10 months of operating costs.

Ms. Christmann stated that the only changes from the previous budget submitted to the Committee in September were the \$8,000 reduction in personnel and the addition of \$5,000 for the EPP program.

Mr. Ingram asked for a motion to approve the 2008 budget. Mr. Meyer moved; Mr. DiPuccio seconded.

Mr. DiPuccio stated that he understood the way the District's funding source was set up regarding being "under" the County's policy and was disappointed that the District could not get out from underneath that policy regarding salaries and other changes.

Mr. DiPuccio stated that he was pleased with the way Staff has done their job.

Mr. Meyer stated that he was concerned about reducing or cutting the budget for outreach and discussed some concerns. i.e. EAB, additional recycling programs, etc.

Ms. Christmann clarified the reduction in the travel/training line item in the business budget stating that the District had received a grant for the pollution prevention internship program.

Mr. Ingram asked the Committee to signify by saying "aye" for approval of the 2008 budget as submitted and "no" for disapproval. All were in favor and the motion to approve the 2008 budget was approved.

C. Approval for District Priority Grants

Ms. Christmann stated that at the May 17, 2007 meeting, the Committee approved the following priorities for the 2008 grant cycle: recycling outreach, public recycling, and organics. The District budgets \$50,000 for non-profits and \$50,000 for communities.

Ms. Christmann stated that only two non-profits applied: Pleasant Ridge Community Council and the University of Cincinnati which was a combined total of \$17,300 in requests. Ms. Christmann summarized each application and stated that the District was recommending funding for both, minus \$255 for the Pleasant Ridge Community Council and stated the reasons why.

The Committee briefly discussed the applications. Mr. Ingram entertained a motion to approve the non-profit grant applications as submitted: Pleasant Ridge Community Council in the amount of \$2,190 and the University of Cincinnati in the amount of \$15,178. Mr. Charlton moved; Mr. Meyer seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

Ms. Christmann stated that for the communities, the District was recommending funding for Crosby Township, Forest Park, Indian Hill, Norwood, St. Bernard, and Springfield Township. The total recommended grant funding is \$42,355. Ms. Christmann stated that all grants were recommended for full funding with the exception of Crosby Township. Staff is recommending reducing funding by \$4,900 because the District does not fund garbage dumpsters (\$3,300) for special events and since the District already sponsors a free computer recycling event, \$1,250 was being cut.

Ms. Christmann stated that the remaining funding of the grant will be used to help fund their recycling drop-off's.

Ms. Christmann outlined the rest of the community grant applications and stated that full funding would be given pending Policy Committee approval.

For a detailed breakdown of applicants and recommended funding, see Attachment E of the Policy Packet.

Mr. Ingram asked if there was a motion to approve the community grants as recommended by Staff. Mr. Meyer moved; Mr. DiPuccio seconded. All were in favor and the community grants were approved.

Mr. DiPuccio suggested that the Committee consider a change in the District Priority Grants by agreeing on certain criteria for how the grants are approved and have Staff make the determinations for grant funding.

Mr. Ingram suggested to have this discussion when all members were present and stated that this item should be included on the agenda for the January meeting.

D. Update on Landfill Odors

Ms. Christmann stated that at the last meeting, the topic of landfill odors and delayed response times were brought up. Since that time, a meeting took place between Hamilton County Public Health, Rumpke, Colerain Township, and Environmental Services to discuss how to respond to odors more quickly.

Ms. Christmann stated that a very nice collaboration between Hamilton County Public Health, Rumpke, and Environmental Services was formed due to this meeting. Ms. Christmann stated that following is how the new complaint system would work: Residents will call Hamilton County Public Health during regular business hours (until 4 pm) if they want to register a landfill odor complaint. After 4 pm and on weekends, residents will call Environmental Services 24-hour air quality hotline. Once the information is received by the Environmental Services on-call employee, they will log that complaint, forward it to Hamilton County Public Health for follow-up the next business day. Immediately after that, the on-call employee will contact Rumpke, who will provide the initial complaint field response.

Ms. Christmann stated that the agencies have worked together and developed a standard operating procedure and necessary complaint forms. This new procedure has received approval from the Colerain Township Trustees. The new procedure went into effect last night (November 14, 2007) and will be evaluated in January, 2008 to determine if improvements or changes are needed.

Mr. DiPuccio asked how this new procedure was being communicated to residents. Ms. Christmann stated that Colerain Township took the lead and it was in the newspaper on Wednesday (November 14, 2007).

Mr. Meyer stated that he was surprised that this issue came before the Committee and he is not sure that the Committee needs to be involved. Mr. Meyer stated that it sounded like there was a plan or at least a proposed meeting prior to the September 20 Policy Committee meeting.

5. INFORMATION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Strategic Plan Update

Ms. Christmann stated that she wanted to remind everyone that the Strategic Planning will take place on Friday, November 30 from 8:30 am – 3:30 pm at the Nathanael Greene Lodge in Green Township.

Ms. Christmann thanked the Committee for speaking with Amy Paul, who is the District's consultant.

Ms. Christmann stated that she e-mailed Committee members' goal priorities and if members have not completed this, to please do so prior to the planning session. Mr. Ingram suggested that the Committee complete the form after the meeting.

B. Annual District Report

Ms. Christmann stated that the Ohio EPA has finished its review of the District's 2006 annual report. This report details the amount of material recycled and the programs implemented in 2006. According to the Ohio EPA, the District's residential/commercial recycling rate is 38.93% which is above the goal of 25% and the industrial recycling rate is 46.38% which is below the goal of 50% which has been the case for the past three years.

Ms. Christmann stated that in Ohio EPA's response, Staff noticed that there was a large increase in the industrial disposal that was sent to Stony Hollow Landfill in Montgomery County. Ms. Christmann stated that she spoke with Ohio EPA about this and they have pinpointed the exact industrial generator that sent the large quantity of material there. Ms. Christmann stated that she was now working with Montgomery County Health District to obtain the exact quantity.

Ms. Christmann stated that Ohio EPA may be able to give the District a one-time exemption which would help the District meet the industrial goal if approved. Ms. Christmann stated that she would keep the Committee updated. Ms. Christmann complimented Ohio EPA on their flexibility.

Mr. DiPuccio stated that in looking at the numbers, they are the best the District can do. What it comes down to is "how good is the documentation that is received" and the response back from the industrial recycling survey? There has to be a cut-off somewhere in terms of how much effort is put into doing that. Mr. DiPuccio stated that 46.38% is very good and the industrial recycling rate is 50%.

Mr. DiPuccio stated that the disposal numbers were very good in terms of their accuracy and the recycling numbers were not quite as comprehensive as one may think.

C. Creative Outdoor Advertising

Ms. Christmann stated that the District received the Prosecutor's Opinion in October, which was e-mailed to the Committee, and the Opinion states that the District does not need an official request for bids for the no-cost service. However, through a request of the Policy Committee, the District

will release an expression of interest to determine if there are other vendors that offer the same type of service.

Ms. Christmann stated that the Prosecutor's Office has requested that the District work with them to develop the expression of interest.

A brief question and answer session ensued.

6. TENTATIVE FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Policy Committee not voting on the District Priority Grants
- Plasma Arc Update
- Wood Waste Update

7. POLICY COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS

Mr. Ingram stated that on behalf of the Policy Committee Ms. Christmann and Staff did a nice job on putting on the awards banquet. Mr. Ingram stated that it ran very well and was very efficient. Mr. Ingram stated that it gave him a feeling of joy to recognize and listen to what the award winners have done during the course of the year.

Mr. Meyer complimented Ms. Christmann on the budget process and stated that he received everything that he needed. Mr. Ingram concurred.

Mr. DiPuccio complimented Hamilton County Public Health and Hamilton County Environmental Services expediting the landfill odor response time issue. Mr. Ingram stated that he also wanted to recognize Mr. DeJonekheere for his work.

Mr. Charlton complimented Staff on the awards luncheon.

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Kempe asked if anyone was looking into Freon recovery. Mr. Ingram asked for clarification. Mr. Kempe stated that he meant a recovery law and supplying programs for freon removal. Ms. Christmann stated that she would get back to him.

9. UPCOMING DISTRICT MEETINGS

The next regularly scheduled Policy Committee meeting will be **Thursday, January 17, 2008, 9:30 am** at Hamilton County Environmental Services, 250 William Howard Taft Road, Cincinnati, Ohio 45219.

10. ADJOURNMENT (Target Time – 3:00 pm)

The meeting was adjourned by acclamation at 2:15 pm.